

Appendix 2 to the Section 42A report for Chapter 34 - Wilding Exotic Trees

Submission Point Number	Original Submission Ref	Submitter	Lowest Clause	Submitter Position	Submission Summary	Planner Recommendation	Deferred	Issue Reference
OS9.6		Drayron, Terry	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Oppose	To allow the introduction of exotic trees by resource consent application.	Accept in Part		see s42a report
OS19.16		Fround, Kain	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Supports the Provisions.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the general support in part as through further evaluation the Policy and Rules have been amended.
OS21.59		Walsh, Alison	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Supports the provisions.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the general support in part as through further evaluation the Policy and Rules have been amended.
OS85.1		Flahive, Gillian	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Remove wilding pines, in particular the pines that are in McDonnell Road.		Out of scope outside TLA/DP function	
OS95.1		Albert Town Community Assoc	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Supports the proposed rules relating to wilding exotic trees but would like them amended to include Albert Town Residential Zones. Supports the height rules for boundary planting. Requests that QLDC add the rule 9.2.3.5 (ii) (Township Zone Rules - Operative District Plan) to mirror 7.5.3.6 (ii) (Residential Areas Rules - Operative District Plan).		Deferred to Hearing Stream business	the provisions in chapter 34 , as a district wide chapter, already apply to all zones. The reference to the Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Strategy in the purpose are intended to show what Council already does towards this issue, not that Council limits its provisions to one area of the District
OS117.12		Lawton, Maggie	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	If certain trees, suitable for building and for energy sources are to be banned from new establishments in the District what is the plan to provide firewood. This may be a difficult subject because of strong opposition to wilding trees but if these trees are to be banned then what is the strategy to provide for firewood in the future. It is a renewable source and therefore, providing the emissions are controlled, should be encouraged.	Accept in Part		see s42a report
OS187.8		Kiddle, Nicholas	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	A full review of the control of wilding exotic species. Support managing the spread of exotic species, but oppose current eradication techniques and policies. There is inconsistency between some of these policies and protection provisions within Chapter 32 on Protected Trees.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the support in managing wilding spread. Council believes that the Exemption in 34.4.3.1 clears up any inconsistencies
OS290.3		Ryan, Christine	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Strongly support this provision, shame we have not implemented it sooner.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the general support in part as through further evaluation the Policy and Rules have been amended.
OS313.3		Langley, John	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	More emphasis district wide, not just Wakatipu Basin. The District Plan needs to develop a strategy to manage existing wilding and exotic trees and shrubs which pose a threat to "landscape, biodiversity and soil resource values" in the entire district	Accept in Part		Council accepts the general support in part as through further evaluation the Policy and Rules have been amended. The paragraph in the purpose 34.1 under contention was intended to clarify that the existing wilding spread and issues associated with it are being controlled through the 'Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Strategy'. The Wilding and Exotic Trees Chapter is District Wide and as such all the objectives, policies and rules apply across the entire District.
OS332.3		this is a personal submission	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Oppose	The district wide ban is not justifiable or practical. Take time to actually consult over this matter; we have not had a community conversation about this here. Reconsider the list of banned species. Identify some pine trees that can be planted under certain conditions ie rather than a PROHIBITED activity it is a CONTROLLED or DISCRETIONARY activity.	Accept in Part		see s42a report
OS386.3		Johnston & Inwood, Lisa & Greg	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Oppose	Oppose overall approach in Chapter 34. Contend that the spread of wilding forests is not an environmental problem but a land management issue with potential economic and environmental benefits if managed intelligently. We would like our council to take a more holistic and sustainable approach recognising that these tree species are now an established part of our wild ecosystem and also part of our cultural heritage. Thus the council must ensure that there are no barriers to the development of a sustainable industry using these forest resources.		Deferred to Hearing Stream Rural	This chapter relates to wilding spread and not forestry practices. As such this submission is out of scope of the chapter and has been deferred to rural chapter. However, Council has amended the Policy and Rules sections of this chapter to allow for some plantings of some wilding species.

Appendix 2 to the Section 42A report for Chapter 34 - Wilding Exotic Trees

Submission Point Number	Original Submission Ref	Submitter	Lowest Clause	Submitter Position	Submission Summary	Planner Recommendation	Deferred	Issue Reference
OS461.1		Battson, Jude	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	Grandview Stages 1, 2 and 3 (includes the Rural Residential zone at Lake Hawea) to not be allowed gum (eucalypts), conifers, broom, gorse, wilding briar, yellow lupins. Also, other trees over 5 metres to be planted 8 metres from the boundary.		Deferred to Hearing Stream Rural	The provisions in the PDP Wilding Exotic Trees Chapter will be district wide and therefore cover the affected area. The weeds as listed are covered under the Otago Regional Council Pest Management Strategy and eucalypts are not recognised in this District as wilding exotics and therefore are not considered necessary to add to the prohibited list. Support for the boundary rules acknowledged and deferred to the rural residential chapter
OS620.2		Ballantyne Investments Ltd	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Supports the avoidance of further spread of identified wilding tree species, especially Douglas Fir and pines.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the general support in part as through further evaluation the Policy and Rules have been amended.
OS684.1		Ramsay, Michael	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Oppose	The policy to ban the planting of wilding pines, exotic species etc. be deleted from the Proposed District Plan.	Reject		see s42a report
OS740.1		Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Control Group	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Strongly affirms the total ban of planting of all wilding species.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the support however through further consideration has allowed the planting of some wilding species.
OS740.2		Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Control Group	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	Support of banning wilding species, but QLDC also need to recognise the importance of encouraging the planing of appropriate "fine non spreading trees".	Accept in Part		Council accepts the support however through further consideration has allowed the planting of some wilding species through resource consent application. Council recognises that the encouragement of planting alternatives is outside the scope of the DP review.
OS740.3		Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Control Group	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	Removal all wildings from Council Reserves and Council land		Out of scope outside TLA/DP function	
OS740.4		Wakatipu Wilding Conifer Control Group	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Other	QLDC needs to advertise through mail outs and social media's etc on wilding pines and appropriate planting		Out of scope outside TLA/DP function	Council recognises that the advertisement on wilding trees is outside the scope of the DP review.
OS784.23		Jeremy Bell Investments Limited	34 Wilding Exotic Trees		Reconsider Rule 34.4 and Table 1 to ensure that there are practical options available for the establishment of shelterbelts within the District . Alternatively, remove prohibited activity status so that the species can be planted when adequate management controls are in place where there is wilding potential.	Accept in Part		Council has amended the Policy and Rules to allow in part for the relief sought.
OS817.5		Te Ao Marama Inc	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	TAMI supports the following points in the proposed District Plan: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Goal 3.2.7 Council will act in accordance with the principles of the Treaty of Waitangi and in partnership with Ngai Tahu - Chapter 5 Tangata Whenua - Chapter 34 Wilding Exotic Trees - The national importance of Ngai Tahu's relationship with its ancestral lands, water, sites, waahi tapu, and other taonga, and protection of its customary rights. - Ngai Tahu's historical and contemporary values, associations, and the reflection of its identity in the rural and built environments. - Ongoing protection in Queenstown Lakes of those rights and interests Ngai Tahu negotiated with the Crown that are provided for in Treaty Settlement legislation and other Crown/Ngai Tahu instruments. - The Council's initial attempts to integrate the provisions of the Tangata Whenua Chapter throughout the Plan. - The promotion and retention of environmental infrastructure, including wetlands. 	Accept in Part		The support for Chapter 34 Wilding Exotic Trees is noted and accepted in part however through further consideration has allowed the planting of some wilding species.
OS829.10		Anderson Branch Creek Ltd	34 Wilding Exotic Trees		This section needs to be amended to controlled or noncomplying rather than prohibited for the species that have commercial value, (radiata and douglas fir)	Accept in Part		Council has amended the Policy and Rules to allow in part for the relief sought.
FS1255.19	332.3	Arcadian Triangle Limited	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Support in part. Allow the submission to the extent of removing hawthorn from the list of prohibited species.	Reject		see s42a report
FS1255.21	684.1	Arcadian Triangle Limited	34 Wilding Exotic Trees	Support	Support in part. Allow the submission to the extent of removing hawthorn from the list of prohibited species.	Reject		see s42a report

Appendix 2 to the Section 42A report for Chapter 34 - Wilding Exotic Trees

Submission Point Number	Original Submission Ref	Submitter	Lowest Clause	Submitter Position	Submission Summary	Planner Recommendation	Deferred	Issue Reference
OS339.126		Alty, Evan	34.1 Purpose	Other	Need to recognise that dense stands of wilding conifers can also affect water yield. Amend as follows: <i>Wilding trees are spreading across parts of the District and have visually degraded parts of the landscape, biodiversity values and can threaten the productive values of the soil resource, <u>and reduce on water yield</u> The spread of wilding trees has left other areas vulnerable to landscape and biodiversity degradation .</i>	Reject		see s42a report
OS373.59		Department of Conservation	34.1 Purpose	Support	34.1 Purpose, 34.2.1 Objective and 34.2.1.1 Policy are supported as these outline the existing problem with wilding trees in this District and the effects this has on the District resources, and managing the further planting of wilding species in this district will help to control further spread of trees.	Accept in Part		Council accepts the support however through further consideration has allowed the planting of some wilding species.
OS386.1		Johnston & Inwood, Lisa & Greg	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	Object to purpose statement where it states •that wilding trees are visually degrading the landscape, and •that they threaten biodiversity.	Reject		see s42a report
OS600.139		Federated Farmers of New Zealand	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	That 34.1 Purpose is re-written to acknowledge that reasonable use of some exotic trees can provide benefit to the District, particularly in the rural context, provided these are appropriately controlled and do not pose a significant pest plant threat.	Reject		Council has acknowledged the importance of some species of wilding trees and while the purpose has not been amended for this submission point a new policy has been proposed to allow for some species to be used in accordance with good management practices
OS706.118		Forest and Bird NZ	34.1 Purpose		Need to recognise that dense stands of wilding conifers can also affect water yield. Amend as follows: Wilding trees are spreading across parts of the District and have visually degraded parts of the landscape, biodiversity values and can threaten the productive values of the soil resource, <u>and reduce on water yield</u> The spread of wilding trees has left other areas vulnerable to landscape and biodiversity degradation.	Reject		see s42a report
FS1034.139	600.139	Upper Clutha Environmental Society (Inc.)	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	The Society OPPOSES the entire submission and seeks that the entire submission is DISALLOWED.	Accept in Part		Accepted partially as the purpose has not been amended
FS1040.62	600.139	Forest and Bird	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	Oppose	Accept in Part		Accepted partially as the purpose has not been amended
FS1132.21	339.126	Federated Farmers of New Zealand	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	Water yield is a regional council consideration	Accept in Part		see s42a report
FS1162.172	706.118	Cooper, James Wilson - represented by GTODD Law	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	Believes that the relief sought in the submission does not result in sound resource management planning. Seeks that all of the relief sought be declined.	Accept		
FS1209.139	600.139	Burdon, Richard	34.1 Purpose	Support	Support entire submission	Reject		The further submission is rejected for the same reason as the original
FS1347.76	373.59	Lakes Land Care	34.1 Purpose	Oppose	Opposes oversewing as a vegetation clearance definition. Assures that it is a management practice used to improve grazing species.		Deferred to Hearing Stream Rural	Relief sought applies more to the other Rural Chapters than 34 Wilding Trees.
OS286.1		Metzger, Urs & Rosalie	34.2 Objective and Policy	Oppose	Remove word 'prohibiting' and possibly replace with 'restrict' - could require any new plantings to limited number or contribute to cost of wilding removal. - Supply a listing of species that can be planted that satisfy shelter belt, heating and income uses.	Accept in Part		Council has amended the Policy and Rules to allow in part for the relief sought.
OS339.127		Alty, Evan	34.2 Objective and Policy	Other	Need to recognise that dense stands of wilding conifers can also affect water yield. Amend as follows: <i>Protect the District's landscape, biodiversity and <u>water and soil</u> resource values from the spread of wilding exotic trees.</i>	Reject		see s42a report
OS514.7		Duncan Fea	34.2 Objective and Policy		Add a new policy: <i>Require removal of established wilding exotic trees as part of the consent for subdivision, use or development of land in the Residential and Rural Living Zones.</i>	Accept in Part		see s42a report
OS514.8		Duncan Fea	34.2 Objective and Policy		Add a new policy: <i>Council work educate and encourage land owners with mature wilding exotic trees to progressively remove the trees. Priority will be given to mature wilding exotic trees in and adjacent to residential areas where they have an adverse impact on amenity values, sunlight and views.</i>		Out of scope outside TLA/DP function	
OS684.2		Ramsay, Michael	34.2 Objective and Policy	Oppose	The policy to ban the planting of wilding pines, exotic species etc. be deleted from the Proposed District Plan.	Reject		see s42a report

Appendix 2 to the Section 42A report for Chapter 34 - Wilding Exotic Trees

Submission Point Number	Original Submission Ref	Submitter	Lowest Clause	Submitter Position	Submission Summary	Planner Recommendation	Deferred	Issue Reference
OS706.119		Forest and Bird NZ	34.2 Objective and Policy		Need to recognise that dense stands of wilding conifers can also affect water yield. Amend as follows: Protect the District's landscape, biodiversity and <u>water and</u> soil resource values from the spread of wilding exotic trees.	Reject		see s42a report
FS1040.20	514.7	Forest and Bird	34.2 Objective and Policy	Support	Support	Reject		The further submission is rejected for the same reason as the original submission.
FS1040.21	514.8	Forest and Bird	34.2 Objective and Policy	Support	Support		Out of scope outside TLA/DP function	
FS1162.173	706.119	Cooper, James Wilson - represented by GTODD Law	34.2 Objective and Policy	Oppose	Believes that the relief sought in the submission does not result in sound resource management planning. Seeks that all of the relief sought be declined.	Accept		Further submission accepted for the same reasons that the original submission was rejected
FS1255.20	286.1	Arcadian Triangle Limited	34.2 Objective and Policy	Support	Support in part. Allow the submission to the extent of removing hawthorn from the list of prohibited species.	Reject		see s42a report
FS1255.22	684.2	Arcadian Triangle Limited	34.2 Objective and Policy	Support	Support in part. Allow the submission to the extent of removing hawthorn from the list of prohibited species.	Reject		according to expert evidence in appendix 4 sterile species are difficult to ensure sterility longterm.
OS600.140		Federated Farmers of New Zealand	34.2.1 Objective.	Support	Objective 34.2.1 is retained as proposed.	Accept		
FS1034.140	600.140	Upper Clutha Environmental Society (Inc.)	34.2.1 Objective.	Oppose	The Society OPPOSES the entire submission and seeks that the entire submission is DISALLOWED.	Reject		The further submission is rejected as Council has found no reason to remove the Objective 34.2.1
FS1209.140	600.140	Burdon, Richard	34.2.1 Objective.	Support	Support entire submission	Accept in Part		This further submission is accepted in part that it supports the retention of the Objective 34.2.1
OS600.141		Federated Farmers of New Zealand	34.2.1.1.	Oppose	Policy 34.2.1.1 is re-considered to assess the viability of developing a new rule along the following lines: 1. Permitted activity criteria for plantings under a certain area (a small geographical area), in low risk conditions (with low risk conditions including a setback from property boundaries to ensure seedlings are likely to be grazed, rather than spread over property boundaries), and; 2. The ability to apply for a consent setting out the management obligations of the consent holder in relation to the pest plant attributes and risk associated with the planting, for small to medium sized plantings, again with appropriate setbacks from property boundaries.	Accept in Part		Council has amended the Policy and Rules to allow in part for the relief sought.
FS1034.141	600.141	Upper Clutha Environmental Society (Inc.)	34.2.1.1.	Oppose	The Society OPPOSES the entire submission and seeks that the entire submission is DISALLOWED.	Reject		The further submission is rejected as the original submission is accepted in part
FS1040.63	600.141	Forest and Bird	34.2.1.1.	Oppose	Oppose	Reject		The further submission is rejected as the original submission is accepted in part
FS1209.141	600.141	Burdon, Richard	34.2.1.1.	Support	Support entire submission	Accept in Part		Council has amended the Policy and Rules to allow in part for the relief sought.
OS72.5		Kelvin Peninsula Community Association	34.4 Rule – Planting of wilding exotic trees	Support		Accept in Part		Council accepts the support however through further consideration has allowed the planting of some wilding species.
OS281.1		Wakatipu Reforestation Trust	34.4 Rule – Planting of wilding exotic trees	Support	That the following are added to the non-planting list in rule 34.4.1 Buddleja (Buddleja davidii) Cotoneaster (Cotoneaster glaucophyllus) Spanish heath (Erica lusitanica) and discuss adding a few other exotic weeds that are becoming prominent in the District.	Accept in Part		see s42a report
OS458.1		Beale, Simon	34.4 Rule – Planting of wilding exotic trees	Support	Support, except amend to exclude Pinus radiata from the list of wilding trees set out under Rule 34.4.1. Pinus radiata should be exempt as it is less invasive than the other species listed under Rule 34.4.1 as it is an important species to the farming community for shelterbelts and for timber.	Accept		
FS1040.19	458.1	Forest and Bird	34.4 Rule – Planting of wilding exotic trees	Oppose	Oppose	Reject		the further submission is rejected as the original is accepted
FS1352.18	72.5	Kawarau Village Holdings Limited	34.4 Rule – Planting of wilding exotic trees	Support	Allow relief sought	Accept in Part		Partially accepted for the same reasons as the original submission
OS339.128		Alty, Evan	34.4.1	Other	Support with following amendments: Add; <u>Buddleja davidii Grey willow – Salix cinerea Crack willow, Salix fragilis Rowan tree, Sorbus aucuparia; Cotoneaster simonsii</u>	Accept		see s42a report
OS373.60		Department of Conservation	34.4.1	Other	Amend Table 1 to include Pinus uncinata Mountain Pine and correct the spelling of Pinus sylvestris .	Accept		see appendix 1

Appendix 2 to the Section 42A report for Chapter 34 - Wilding Exotic Trees

Submission Point Number	Original Submission Ref	Submitter	Lowest Clause	Submitter Position	Submission Summary	Planner Recommendation	Deferred	Issue Reference
OS501.7		Woodlot Properties Limited	34.4.1		There are a number of cultivars of the Hawthorn laevegata species that are sterile and pose no risk in terms of wilding spread. In the submitters opinion, sterile cultivars should not be captured by Provision 34.4.1. Requests that item (l) of the proposed Provision 34.4.1 is re-worded to read: <u>(l) Hawthorn, except sterile cultivars such as Crataegus laevegata "Pauls Scarlet", Crataegus laevegata "Plena" and Crataegus laevegata "Rosea flora plena".</u> Requests that the list of species and genera relating to proposed Provision 34.4.1 is investigated by an expert to ensure that other useful sterile cultivars are not needlessly prohibited from being planted in the District.	Reject		according to expert evidence in appendix 4 sterile species are difficult to ensure sterility longterm.
OS706.120		Forest and Bird NZ	34.4.1		Support with following amendments: Add; Buddleja davididi Grey willow – Salix cinerea Crack willow, Salix fragilis Rowan tree, Sorbus aucuparia; Cotoneaster simonsii	Accept		see s42a report
FS1040.18	373.60	Forest and Bird	34.4.1	Support	Support	Accept		
FS1091.28	706.120	Jeremy Bell Investments Limited	34.4.1	Oppose	Disallow. Planting of wilding trees should not be prohibited because they can make useful shelter belts. The planting of shelter belts is important to enable pasture and stock protection for rural activities. This enables productivity of farming to be maintained or increased, improving the efficiency of land use activities throughout the district. Managing the effects of wilding trees more adequately satisfies the requirement of sustainable management than an out-right ban.	Accept in Part		further submission is accepted partially. Policies and rules have been amended to allow partially for relief sought
FS1102.7	501.7	Cranfield, Bob and Justine	34.4.1	Oppose	Oppose whole submission. The ONL line was clarified and confirmed in its present position in the Environment Court Judgement (HIL v QLDC) and should not be rezoned as rural residential or rural lifestyle.		Deferred to the landscape line location hearing	ONL lines are better suited to the landscape line hearing than wilding trees
FS1162.174	706.120	Cooper, James Wilson - represented by GTODD Law	34.4.1	Oppose	Believes that the relief sought in the submission does not result in sound resource management planning. Seeks that all of the relief sought be declined.	Reject		the further submission is rejected as the original is accepted
FS1270.87	501.7	Hansen Family Partnership	34.4.1	Support	Supports in part. Leave is reserved to alter this position, and seek changes to the proposed provisions, after review of further information from the submitter. Seeks conditional support for allowing the submission, subject to the review of further information that will be required to advance the submission.	Reject		further submission rejected for the same reasons as the original
FS1289.7	501.7	Oasis In The Basin Association	34.4.1	Oppose	The whole of the submission be allowed.	Reject		further submission rejected for the same reasons as the original
FS1347.77	373.60	Lakes Land Care	34.4.1	Oppose	Opposes oversewing as a vegetation clearance definition. Assures that it is a management practice used to improve grazing species.		Deferred to Hearing Stream Rural	Oversewing is an issue better related to the rural chapters than wilding trees
OS386.2		Johnston & Inwood, Lisa & Greg	34.4.2 Exemption	Oppose	Include an exemption in section 34.4.2 to allow the listed tree species to be planted if the land manager can show they will employ management techniques to restrict the spread of trees from their plantations onto their neighbouring properties. This may include planting a buffer of non-spreading trees, removing wilding trees within a specified radius of the site, or working with the neighbouring properties to develop a sustainable management strategy.	Accept in Part		relief sought is partially accepted through amendments to policies and rules sections